Designing and Implementing Policies Related to Career Management Skills (CMS)
Designing and Implementing Policies Related to Career Management Skills (CMS)
This is an independent report commissioned by the European Lifelong Guidance Policy Network (ELGPN), a Member State network in receipt of EU financial support under the Lifelong Learning Programme and the Erasmus+ Programme. The views expressed are those of ELGPN and do not necessarily reflect the official position of the European Commission or any person acting on behalf of the Commission.

This tool has been developed in 2009-15 by the members of ELGPN, working in Work Package/Policy Review Cluster on Career Management Skills with the support of consultants Annemarie Oomen 2013-15 (the Netherlands) and Prof Ronald Sultana 2009-12 (Malta), and lead country representatives Lena Nicolaou 2013-15 (Cyprus), Anne Froberg and Jørgen Brock 2014-15 (Denmark), Jasmin Muhic 2009-12 (Czech Republic) and partners of the ELGPN including the International Association for Educational and Vocational Guidance (IAEVG), the European Forum for Student Guidance (Fedora) (now merged with the European Association for International Education - EAIE), the European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training (Cedefop), the European Training Foundation (ETF), the International Centre for Career Development and Public Policy (ICCDPP), the Public Employment Services (PES) Network, the Euroguidance Network, the European Trade Union Confederation (ETUC) and the European Youth Forum.
Contents

Country codes........................................................................................................................................................................................... 6
Executive Summary ................................................................................................................................................................................ 7
Introduction ............................................................................................................................................................................................ 13
Lifelong guidance and CMS............................................................................................................................................................... 13
Origins and aims of the tool .............................................................................................................................................................. 15
Structure of the tool ............................................................................................................................................................................. 15

1 CAREER MANAGEMENT SKILLS ...................................................................................................................................................... 17

What are the competences that citizens of all ages need in order to effectively manage their career in a lifelong perspective? How can such competences be organised within a framework that is meaningful in their substance and in developmental terms? .................................................................................... 17
Lessons learned (What works? What does not work?) ............................................................................................................. 17
Examples .................................................................................................................................................................................................. 18
Conclusions and Recommendations .............................................................................................................................................. 19

2 ACQUISITION AND DEVELOPMENT OF CAREER MANAGEMENT SKILLS ........................................................ 21

How can such competences be taught in educational and other contexts, in ways that, while effectively catering for all citizens, are also sensitive to different life development challenges, and the specific concerns of groups and individuals with diverse social, economic, cultural and other needs? Which pedagogical/andragogical strategies and resources are most effective in enabling the mastery of career management competences? ........................................................................................................................................... 21
Lessons learned (What works? What does not work?) ............................................................................................................. 21
Examples .................................................................................................................................................................................................. 22
Conclusions and Recommendations .............................................................................................................................................. 23

3 EFFECTIVE STAKEHOLDER CO-OPERATION .............................................................................................................................. 25

How can different providers work together to offer CMS programmes more effectively, in ways that make the best use of their specialised knowledge of the worlds of education, training, and employment? ........................................................................................................................................... 25
4 TRAINERS AND PROVIDERS

Who should provide CMS training, and what role should be played by guidance staff in developing and delivering CMS training in different contexts and settings? How can CMS staff be trained in ways that render them more effective in helping citizens to develop CMS?

Lessons learned (What works? What does not work?)
Examples
Conclusions and Recommendations

5 STRATEGIC POLICY DECISIONS

What strategic policy decisions need to be taken in order to widen access to CMS provision, to assure its quality, and to ensure that all citizens have the opportunity to master key career management competences effectively?

Lessons learned (What works? What does not work?)
Examples
Conclusions and Recommendations

6 ASSESSMENT AND ACCREDITATION

How can the mastery of career management competences be assessed and accredited in ways that support career development for different target groups and across different life stages?

Lessons learned (What works? What does not work?)
Examples
Conclusions and Recommendations

7 PROMOTION OF CITIZEN AGENCY

How can we ensure that citizens are able to decode the world around them, so that while they are empowered to develop key competences that support career development, they are also critically aware of the economic constraints that limit their options and capacities, and do not assume that they are individually responsible for structural and systemic failures?

Lessons learned (What works? What does not work?)
Examples
Conclusions and Recommendations

8 CAREER MANAGEMENT SKILLS IN TRANSITIONS

How can employed and unemployed people acquire CMS in PES contexts, in ways that support different transitions, and the specific needs and concerns of groups and individuals with diverse age, social, economic, cultural and other backgrounds?

Lessons learned (What works? What does not work?)
Examples
Conclusions and Recommendations
9 ROLE OF SOCIAL PARTNERS ............................................................................................................................................................45

What role should be played by the social partners (employers and trade unions) in helping citizens to develop career management competences, facilitating their transitions throughout life?.................45

Lessons learned (What works? What does not work?)..................................................................................................................45
Examples ..................................................................................................................................................................................................45
Conclusions and Recommendations..................................................................................................................................................45

10 QUALITY OF CMS PROGRAMMES..................................................................................................................................................47

Which criteria should be used in order to evaluate the quality of CMS programmes? ..........................................................47
Lessons learned (What works? What does not work?)..................................................................................................................47
Examples .................................................................................................................................................................................................48
Conclusions and Recommendations..................................................................................................................................................49

11 MONITORING IMPACT ........................................................................................................................................................................51

Which kind of data needs to be generated in order to measure the impact of CMS programmes? ..............................51
Lessons learned (What works? What does not work?)..................................................................................................................51
Examples ..................................................................................................................................................................................................51
Conclusions and Recommendations..................................................................................................................................................52
Way forward............................................................................................................................................................................................53
References................................................................................................................................................................................................55
## Country codes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AT</td>
<td>Austria</td>
<td>IT</td>
<td>Italy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BE</td>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>LT</td>
<td>Lithuania</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BG</td>
<td>Bulgaria</td>
<td>LU</td>
<td>Luxembourg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CH</td>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>LV</td>
<td>Latvia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CY</td>
<td>Cyprus</td>
<td>MT</td>
<td>Malta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CZ</td>
<td>Czech Republic</td>
<td>NL</td>
<td>The Netherlands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DK</td>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>Norway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DE</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>PL</td>
<td>Poland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EE</td>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td>PT</td>
<td>Portugal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EL</td>
<td>Greece</td>
<td>RO</td>
<td>Romania</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ES</td>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>RS</td>
<td>Serbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HU</td>
<td>Hungary</td>
<td>SE</td>
<td>Sweden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FI</td>
<td>Finland</td>
<td>SI</td>
<td>Slovenia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FR</td>
<td>France</td>
<td>SK</td>
<td>Slovakia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HR</td>
<td>Croatia</td>
<td>TR</td>
<td>Turkey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IE</td>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>UK</td>
<td>The United Kingdom</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Executive Summary

Career Management Skills (CMS) enable citizens to manage their individual life paths in education, training and work across the lifespan. A key aim of lifelong guidance provision should be the acquisition of CMS. Lifelong guidance refers to a range of activities supporting citizens individually and collectively which can be delivered by education and training organisations, public employment services, stand-alone career services, social partners or community organisations. CMS development constitutes an important objective of lifelong guidance services. Lifelong guidance has been the subject of two Resolutions of the Council (Education, Youth) of the European Union in 2004 and 2008. Each of these made reference to the importance of CMS development for citizens. In addressing Europe 2020 targets, the development of the CMS of citizens is a critical tool for employment, education and training, youth and social policies (European Commission, 2011).

An extensive research base provides evidence for the impact of lifelong guidance in the sectors of schools, vocational education and training (VET), higher education (HE), adult education, employment and social inclusion. (Hooley, 2014). Advice and information on the development of policies and systems for lifelong guidance, including CMS in each sector and across sectors are provided in the ELGPN Tool No. 6: Guidelines for Policies and Systems Development for Lifelong Guidance: A Reference Framework for the EU and for the Commission, which also includes examples of ‘good practice’ (ELGPN, 2015).

This present tool is one of the results of the co-operation at EU level within the European Lifelong Guidance Policy Network (ELGPN). The ELGPN aims to assist the EU Member States, neighbouring countries and the European Commission in developing European co-operation on lifelong guidance in both the education and the employment sectors. Its purpose is to promote co-operation and systems development at member-country level in implementing the priorities identified in the EU Resolutions on Lifelong Guidance (2004, 2008).

The ELGPN is a unique European platform to present, exchange, and discuss the results of lifelong guidance provision in the Member States and neighbouring countries. Likewise it influences related units, working groups and networks for which lifelong guidance is of relevance in order to give an impulse for further development (e.g. schools, the European Network of the Public Employment Services). This co-operation results in products such as Concept Notes and in Tools, like this present tool, to support further deliberations in Member States with their continuous efforts in developing lifelong guidance. They support ELGPN delegates in providing relevant impulses to other networks and working groups, in dissemination, in discussion, in current and in informed development.

### Table 1: Summary of policy lessons learned by Member States in the implementation of CMS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions that policies need to address (ELGPN, 2012)</th>
<th>Lessons learned by member countries in CMS-related policies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1. What do CMS mean in your country?                 | • In a simple literal translation of the English terms and definitions of lifelong guidance and CMS the core of those concepts may be lost.  
• The set of CMS in your country needs to be defined and be grounded in the national context and set out in a national CMS framework. |
| 2. How will citizens develop CMS throughout their lifetime? | A CMS framework, detailing the CMS development of all citizens over the life-span, addresses the questions:  
• What CMS (knowledge, skills and attitudes) to learn?  
• How to learn CMS?  
• When or where/in which context, CMS are learned?  
• How is the CMS framework going to be evaluated? |
| 3. What co-ordination and co-operation is required for specialised input in developing and offering a CMS programme? | • In drafting a national CMS framework, a co-ordinated approach should involve stakeholders across various policy sectors, e.g. education and employment. The same applies to CMS programmes arising from or initiated at regional, local and institutional levels. |
| 4. Who will teach and train citizens in CMS development? How are guidance (semi-) professionals trained in delivering CMS teaching and training? | • CMS development needs to be supported by skilled, well-trained and motivated professionals and semi-professionals.  
• 42% of European teachers currently have a high or moderate level of need for professional development in career guidance as shown in the *Teaching and Learning International Survey TALIS 2013* of the OECD (In: European Commission /EACEA /Eurydice /Cedefop, 2014, p.95). |
| 5. Which strategic decisions need to be taken to ensure wide access to CMS and the monitoring of its quality? | • To boost the widening of access to CMS development for citizens in any country, guidance should be made a compulsory element of curricula in schools, VET and HE.  
• Attention is drawn to the lack of access to guidance services as indicated by 45% of the special Eurobarometer respondents in the EU Member States (European 2014). |
| 6. How should CMS be assessed with citizens over the life-span? | • Parallel to the development of a national CMS framework, the development of tools for assessing personal CMS development should be undertaken. |
| 7. How to ensure that citizens are empowered to develop CMS and understand external influences such as the influence of society on their career paths? | • Key to effective CMS development of citizens – which empowers them to develop CMS and understand external influences – is skilled, well-trained and motivated staff who have a holistic approach to guidance (life-long, life-span), who understand what CMS are, and who can deliver it professionally. |
| 8. How can employed and unemployed citizens learn and acquire CMS? | • For adults, whether employed or unemployed, CMS development should be based on reflection and the evaluation of the career competences they have already acquired.  
• The guidance of adults should be based on their identified needs and build on their existing CMS strengths and capacities. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example of how a member country dealt with this CMS-related policy question</th>
<th>Conclusions and Recommendations by ELGPN delegates</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>A note on the concept of CMS in the national context was developed, exploring the meaning of CMS in the country, adopting a national language term for CMS, and proposing the concept of 'career learning' for further development in the country (DK, FI, IS, NO, SE).</strong></td>
<td><strong>• Gather together a group of stakeholders from different sectors and experts to explore the concept of lifelong guidance, of CMS, to resolve the language issues related to the definition of CMS, to explore the &quot;questions that policies need to address&quot; and to propose an agenda and an initial plan to facilitate a common understanding of CMS.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The implementation of lifelong guidance and CMS development nationally has been anchored in schools, VET, the public employment service (PES) and centres for lifelong career guidance (HR).</strong></td>
<td><strong>• CMS development should be considered as a 'work in progress': citizens will have developed CMS to varying degrees and the acquisition of CMS should not be assumed. • For consistency reasons use the same concepts and methods for CMS development across the various sectors.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The Ministry of Education and Culture, the Ministry of Labour Welfare and Social Insurance and the Human Resource Development Authority co-operated in order to promote and share the knowledge of the world of education, training and employment. Through their co-operation school counsellors and guidance counsellors attended seminars on CMS (CY).</strong></td>
<td><strong>A recommended way of co-operation on CMS-related policies and of co-ordinating the shared guidance provision for citizens is to establish a National Guidance Forum. This Forum should represent all key stakeholders; have a clear remit to develop a CMS framework and to advise on CMS-related policies; and is in direct contact with Ministries.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Guidance counsellors received professional development to support them in designing, delivering and reviewing CMS learning activities for citizens (AT).</strong></td>
<td><strong>• All initial teacher training should include a compulsory 'guidance' and CMS development module, with theoretical background and methodologies of CMS development, assessment, how to integrate CMS teaching in (school) subjects and get to know real experiences in enterprises. • All semi-professionals should have the opportunity to qualify in guidance and have the support/co-operation of guidance professionals to develop and maintain the lifelong guidance perspective.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CMS development was anchored nationally in steering documents and in the curricula of various levels of education. In HE, as part of the European Higher Education Area, the issue of students’ employability is given attention (SE).</td>
<td><strong>Endorsement of policy decisions on CMS development for citizens should be reached at a high level among various ministries and ratified with laws, acts, or measures particularly concerning national/regional curricula, adequate funding, co-ordinated national strategies, similar milestones, and common further implementation steps.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CMS development has been assessed by using benchmarks (defined success criteria) (IE), by providing 'evidence' by the student (MT) and by means of a student portfolio (AT, DE, DK, EL, FI, FR, HR, LU, UK).</td>
<td><strong>• Actions to develop formative and summative evaluation of CMS should be undertaken. • Awards and other mechanisms to recognise and accredit experiences related to the development of CMS are features of effective guidance provision.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour market courses provided by PES often include information about the current situation in the labour market aiming at giving the participants a realistic view of opportunities and requirements to get a job and stay in it, and how structural (and economic) mechanisms effect the individual's options (NO).</td>
<td><strong>Assessment of the mastery of CMS development should not be restricted to self-assessment only. It should be linked to and set against societal challenges: managing difficult life and labour market circumstances and reacting positively to changes.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Since CMS development services have been implemented in the employment sector, citizens can receive for a number of hours a year: career coaching and / or job seeking in small groups; or individual coaching and support for job finding/engaging (FI).</td>
<td><strong>A CMS framework provides a basis for the assessment of attained CMS among employed and unemployed people and it provides the guiding principles for their further learning.</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Questions that policies need to address (ELGPN, 2012) | Lessons learned by member countries in CMS-related policies
---|---
9. What is the role of the social partners in developing CMS among citizens? | • Employers express their interest in the development of soft skills of citizens, not being aware that very often they actually mean CMS development. • Trade unions inform their members about their rights, create awareness of CMS related issues and may provide guidance and training of CMS development.

10. Which criteria should be used to evaluate the quality of CMS provision? | • The following criteria should be used to evaluate the quality of CMS provision: ‘service provision and improvement’; ‘practitioner competence’; ‘citizen/user involvement’; ‘cost-benefits to government’ and ‘cost-benefits to individuals’. • To evaluate CMS provision, decide on the nature of the evaluation: assessment of needs, of theory, of implementation, of impact or of efficiency.

11. How to measure the impact of CMS programmes? | • The level, type and possible beneficiaries of the impact could and should be distinguished if considering measuring the impact of CMS programmes. • Both qualitative and quantitative evaluation approaches have been used successfully with CMS impact measurements.

References


### Example of how a member country dealt with this CMS-related policy question

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9. What is the role of the social partners in developing CMS among citizens?</td>
<td>Employers express their interest in the development of soft skills of citizens, not being aware that very often they actually mean CMS development. Trade unions inform their members about their rights, create awareness of CMS related issues and may provide guidance and training of CMS development. Employers opened their business for career exposure visits with a teacher/counsellor/mentor from a school (MT) or they contributed to career weeks in schools (IE). Teachers were offered the possibility of internships in enterprises outside the school system to develop and broaden their knowledge of different employment settings (AT).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Which criteria should be used to evaluate the quality of CMS provision?</td>
<td>The following criteria should be used to evaluate the quality of CMS provision: 'service provision and improvement'; 'practitioner competence'; 'citizen/user involvement', 'cost-benefits to government' and 'cost-benefits to individuals'. To evaluate CMS provision, decide on the nature of the evaluation: assessment of needs, of theory, of implementation, of impact or of efficiency. A national project developed 'Cross-sectoral Guidelines for Quality Assurance in Guidance' including CMS development (HR). An input-process-outcome-evaluation framework could be used. Recommended is the use of the indicators, criteria and possible data as indicated in the ELGPN QAE framework (ELGPN, 2012). The ELGPN QAE Templates contain examples on what and how to evaluate the quality in CMS provision (ELGPN, 2015).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. How to measure the impact of CMS programmes?</td>
<td>The level, type and possible beneficiaries of the impact could and should be distinguished if considering measuring the impact of CMS programmes. Both qualitative and quantitative evaluation approaches have been used successfully with CMS impact measurements. CMS development as part of guidance did have impact on policies aiming at (in Hooley, 2014): Tackling early school leaving and NEET; retention, achievement, transitions from school to school or to work; the employability of graduates; changing the situation for adult learners; improving the key competences of employed citizens with benefits such as economic outcomes for enterprises and career outcomes; citizens returning to work after unemployment or a (unplanned) career break; decreasing rates of early retirement. It is recommended to take notice of the existing research and take it into account in deciding on the nature of the impact to be measured. There are quantitative and various qualitative research approaches that have been used effectively in measuring the impact of guidance of which CMS development should be the key aim and learning outcome. ‘The Evidence-Base on Lifelong Guidance: A guide to key findings for effective policy and practice’ (Hooley, 2014) provides several examples.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Lifelong guidance and CMS

Lifelong guidance has been the subject of two Resolutions of the Council (Education, Youth) of the European Union in 2004 and 2008. In the 2008 Resolution the Council reaffirmed the definition of lifelong guidance as:

“a continuous process that enables citizens at any age and at any point in their lives to identify their capacities, competences and interests, to make educational, training and occupational decisions, and to manage their individual life paths in learning, work and other settings in which those capacities and competences are learned and/or used. Guidance covers a range of individual and collective activities relating to information-giving, counselling, competence assessment, support, and the teaching of decision-making and career management skills” (2008, p. 2).

Both Resolutions drew attention to the importance of career management skills (CMS) development for citizens. These refer to

“a range of competences which provide structured ways for individuals and groups to gather, analyse, synthesise and organise self, educational and occupational information, as well as the skills to make and implement decisions and transitions” (ELGPN, 2012a, p.21).

Teaching career decision-making and career management skills is one of a range of lifelong guidance activities which include: Informing, Advising, Counselling, Assessing, Enabling, Advocating, Networking, Feeding back, Managing, Innovating systems change, Signposting, Mentoring, Sampling and Following up (Ford, 2002, in: Oomen and Plant, 2014). Various terms are used in different countries to describe these activities. These terms include educational, vocational or career guidance, career guidance and counselling, occupational guidance, and career counselling. To avoid ambiguity, the term ‘guidance’ is used in this tool to identify any or all of these terms. The term ‘lifelong guidance’, parallel to ‘lifelong learning’, indicates the aspiration to make such guidance available on a lifelong basis.

Guidance activities can be delivered by professionals such as a guidance or career counsellor or by semi-professionals. Semi-professionals may vary from a tutor or subject teacher to an employment counsellor (Zelloth, 2009) and they may not necessarily have undertaken specialised training in guidance. They are paid for the guidance activities that they perform but this is not their main professional activity.
A key aim of lifelong guidance is to help individuals to manage their careers; and the learning outcomes should be the acquisition and development of CMS. CMS enable citizens at any age or stage of development to manage their learning and work life paths. CMS is the subject of Guideline 1 of Guidelines for Policies and Systems Development for Lifelong Guidance: A Reference Framework for the EU and for the Commission (ELGPN, 2015b). The Guideline defines CMS, explains its importance, and provides suggestions for good policies.

**Why is CMS important?**

Citizens need to learn CMS to enable them to cope with various challenges throughout their lives, including more frequent career changes, and intensified job insecurity (see: Sultana, 2012a).

Lifelong guidance and the development of CMS are highly related to current national and European policies to reach Europe 2020 targets. Lifelong guidance and the development of CMS contribute to:

- Council of the European Union recommendations regarding New Skills (2007), Early School Leaving (2011), Youth Guarantee (2013a), Apprenticeship (2013b) and Rethinking Education (2013c);
- National policies to combat youth unemployment, tackle early school leaving, enhance the permeability of education pathways, and improve the match of skills demand and supply in the labour market. CMS empower European citizens to develop individualised solutions for the development, transitions and (un)planned challenges they meet and is therefore a tool for the implementation of the flexicurity concept in various Member States.

Under the Europe 2020 strategy (European Commission, 2011) a renewed ‘Public Employment System’ (European Commission, 2013) is foreseen with “the provision of (online) tools and primary services to support individual career management” (ibid., p.4). CMS development is an important asset in the European (European Commission, 2015a) and national employment policies to enhance labour supply and skills, to enhance the functioning of labour markets, to boost the demand for labour, and to ensure fairness, combating poverty and promoting equal opportunities. Migrants (Cedefop, 2014) and those challenged by the economic crisis, social exclusion and uncertain careers (Cedefop, 2015) can also benefit from guidance and CMS development.

Research evidence (Hooley, 2014) suggests that guidance and the systemic development of CMS impacts on educational, economic, employment and social outcomes.

In the education system it:
- Engages individuals with learning.
- Clarifies pathways through learning and work.

In the employment system it:
- Supports individuals to make the transition to employment.
- Increases the flexibility of the labour market.
- Helps to ensure that skills are used effectively.
- Supports individuals to be resilient when facing change.

However, the guidance needs of citizens were not met in 2004 (OECD) and have not been met in 2014 as reported in the Special Eurobarometer (European Commission, 2014) because the guidance provision is fragmented at national, regional and local levels and continues to show serious gaps across Europe (Kraatz, 2015).

CMS should feature prominently should feature prominently in education and training curricula and in guidance activities provided by the education and employment sectors. Citizens can be challenged by diverse demands in education, work and life and may need tailored CMS provision. CMS develop-
ment should be provided by skilled, well-trained and motivated staff who understand what CMS are, and who can deliver it professionally.

Origins and aims of the tool

During the 2013–14 ELGPN Work Programme 18 ELGPN member countries focused on testing, adapting, developing and implementing CMS at national level published in the Resource Kit (ELGPN, 2012a, pp. 21–33, pp. 85–95) and in Concept Note No.3 (Gravina and Lovšin, 2012).

The content of this tool has been derived from a number of sources:

- The outcomes of the meetings of the 18 member countries focusing on testing, adapting, developing and implementing CMS on a national level during the 2013–14 Work Programme;
- Two extensive rounds of data collection on progress made in the development of CMS-related policies development among national ELGPN delegations 2013–14 between meetings;
- Sectoral table discussions during the ELGPN Plenary Meeting held in Riga on 3 March 2015;
- Publications on CMS related policy issues which refer to ELGPN experiences;
- EU policy instruments such as the Resolutions and Recommendations of the European Council;
- Knowledge gained from policy studies and reviews (of guidance) undertaken or commissioned by the European Commission, European Parliament, Cedefop, ETF, Eurydice, OECD, the European Network of the Public Employment Services, in which several members of ELGPN participated.

In the Member States, CMS development is not a policy in itself. The concept of CMS is used in and/or applied to any current national guidance policies or policy featuring guidance in and across the sectors: schools, vocational education and training (VET), higher education (HE), adult education, employment and social inclusion. Hence, the term ‘CMS-related policy’ is used.

This ELGPN tool is addressed to policy-makers who wish to (further) develop a comprehensive national guidance policy with the focus on the acquisition of CMS. This need may arise in the light of the various (lifelong) guidance policies which exist in Europe, of closing existing gaps in national provision, and in meeting future approaches to (lifelong) guidance.

This tool is intended to support policy-makers in considering each of these important questions by sharing insights, good practice and conclusions across the ELGPN member countries.

As countries are at different stages of progress in the development of CMS related policy, the coverage in the chapters of the this tool differs to the extent to which it provides satisfying ‘answers’. However, there are no ‘copy, paste’ solutions here as the national context and guidance practice should be taken in consideration when developing a national policy.

Structure of the tool

In developing the CMS-related policies, 11 questions that policies need to address were identified in the Resource Kit (ELGPN, 2012a, pp. 22-23). These questions, presented below, provide the organising framework for this tool:

1. What are the competences that citizens of all ages need in order to effectively manage their career in a lifelong perspective? How can such competences be organised within a framework that is meaningful in their substance and in developmental terms?
2. How can such competences be taught in educational and other contexts, in ways that, while effectively catering for all citizens, are also sensitive to different life development challenges, and the specific concerns of groups and individuals

---

1 BE, BG, CY, CZ, DK, EL, HR, IE, IT, LT, LU, MT, NO, PT, RO, SE, SI, TR and CH as an observer.
with diverse social, economic, cultural and other needs? Which pedagogical/andragogical strategies and resources are most effective in enabling the mastery of career management competences?

3. How can different providers work together to offer CMS programmes more effectively, in ways that make the best use of their specialised knowledge of the worlds of education, training, and employment?

4. Who should provide CMS training, and what role should be played by guidance staff in developing and delivering CMS training in different contexts and settings? How can CMS staff be trained in ways that render them more effective in helping citizens to develop CMS?

5. What strategic policy decisions need to be taken in order to widen access to CMS provision, to assure its quality, and to ensure that all citizens have the opportunity to master key career management competences effectively?

6. How can the mastery of career management competences be assessed and accredited in ways that support career development for different target groups and across different life stages?

7. How can we ensure that citizens are able to decode the world around them, so that while they are empowered to develop key competences that support career development, they are also critically aware of the economic constraints that limit their options and capacities, and do not assume that they are individually responsible for structural and systemic failures?

8. How can such CMS be developed with employed and unemployed people in PES contexts, in ways that support different transitions, and the specific needs and concerns of groups and individuals with diverse age, social, economic, cultural and other backgrounds?

9. What role should be played by the social partners (employers and trade unions) in helping citizens to develop career management competences, facilitating their transitions throughout life?

10. Which criteria should be used in order to evaluate the quality of CMS programmes?

11. Which kind of data needs to be generated in order to measure the impact of CMS programmes?

One chapter each is devoted to the eleven questions. Each chapter starts with the main ‘lessons learned about what works/what does not work?’ in developing CMS-related policies by the ELGPN delegates at member-country level. This is followed by some examples of how various Member States and neighbouring countries dealt with this CMS-related policy question. Finally, for each question, conclusions and recommendations provided by ELGPN delegates can be found.

As to the last two questions relating to evaluation and impact measurement, since the publication of the Resource Kit in 2012 the ELGPN has designed two specific tools. Question 10 on the evaluation of the quality of CMS programmes is partially addressed by the Quality-Assurance and Evidence-Base (QAE) Framework (ELGPN, 2012b, pp. 29-32 and pp. 778). In ELGPN Tool no. 5 (ELGPN Tool No. 5, 2015c) CMS is referred to in the QAE Templates, based on member country inputs and feedback with various national examples provided.

The existing evidence of the impact of lifelong guidance, which includes information on impact measurement is extensively addressed in ELGPN Tool no.3 The Evidence-BASE on Lifelong Guidance: A guide to key findings for effective policy and practice’ (Hooley, 2014). These specific ELGPN Tools will be explained in the responses to questions 10 and 11.

The executive summary preceding the chapters is specifically aimed at policy-makers with little time to read. The table in the executive summary follows the structure of the chapters. The first column provides the key policy questions that need to be addressed. In each row the most significant ‘lessons learned’ for that key policy question by Member States in CMS-related policies is highlighted, followed by an illustrative example and ends with generic conclusions and recommendations.

The references to specific reports are limited to the core publications presented in the executive summary.
What are the competences that citizens of all ages need in order to effectively manage their career in a lifelong perspective? How can such competences be organised within a framework that is meaningful in their substance and in developmental terms?

Lessons learned (What works? What does not work?)

- The English term and definition of CMS cannot be literally translated into another language as the core of the concepts of lifelong guidance and CMS can be lost for semantic reasons, as several member countries have experienced. Literal equivalent words, such as ‘career’ or ‘management’, may make no sense, may be understood differently or have a slightly negative connotation.
- In resolving the language issue, and being aware of the possible semantic alteration, the CMS definition can be customised in the language of a country to reflect relevant existing national documents and strategies, the vocabulary of citizens and employers, and to give guidance and CMS a wider perspective derived from recent career theories.
- The term CMS itself needs to be defined and the range of CMS needs to be elaborated in a national context. Among member countries it proved to be helpful to organise the set of CMS to be developed in a framework to underpin and structure the overall and sector CMS-related policies. A national CMS framework reflects the current challenges and priorities of the education and labour market sectors and is meaningfully linked to other skills e.g. basic 21st century skills, key competences such as entrepreneurship, the European and/or national qualification framework, and the curricular values and pedagogical philosophies of the country (Sultana, 2012b).
- Before developing a national CMS framework the aims and objectives of the framework should be clear.

A national CMS framework should cover four dimensions:

1. CMS: What to learn? CMS learning areas may be ‘personal management; learning and work exploration; life/work building’ or ‘self-knowledge related to career development;
Career Management Skills

exploring learning pathways and the world of work; decision-making and implementation’; or part of “general employability skills”. The ‘What to learn?’ dimension should take into account that life and work progression are not linear and that citizens may have to take up their CMS development (again) at unexpected moments due to events and changing life circumstances outside of their control.

2. How are CMS learned? This dimension refers to learning models, learning outcomes and progression. This is a pedagogical question, often influenced by policy expectations that reflect both cultural as well as national systems differences to guidance provision, for example CMS in career learning, career development or career construction.

3. ‘When should CMS be learned?’ or ‘Where, in which context, are CMS learned?’ This field is perceived as a crucial aspect of the CMS framework. It includes the defining of levels of CMS progression from basic to more advanced and specific (e.g. the logic of European language levels A1-C2). This is related to question 6 on the assessment of CMS. This dimension takes into account that the individual process of CMS development could restart at any moment and that guidance services should make capacity available to help individuals manage in their different situations.

4. How is the CMS framework going to be evaluated? Consider assessment perspectives such as:
   ○ Needs: Is there a need for this framework?
   ○ Theory: Is this framework conceptualised in a way that it should work?
   ○ Implementation: Was this framework implemented properly and according to the plan?
   ○ Impact: Did this framework have an impact on its intended targets/target groups?
   ○ Efficiency: Is this framework cost effective?

Who will be involved in the evaluation: professionals, trainers, practitioners, end-users?

- It is important to define beforehand the scope of the intended national CMS framework. If for example it is drafted for the educational sector (schools, vocational training, higher education, adult learning) only, the question should be raised how the continuity of CMS development will be assured in the employment sector, both in the perspective of the future CMS-related policies development and for the individual citizen.
- In a national CMS framework ‘What CMS to learn?’ can be formulated as ‘close’, ‘distant’ or ‘challenging’ compared to the existing practice in guidance provision in the target-sector(s). This choice has major consequences for the strategy to implement CMS development.
- Whether it is an academic or more pragmatic approach to creating a CMS framework, those drafting the framework should be well aware of the professionals or semi-professionals that implement the CMS framework. These target group(s) need to understand the CMS framework and therefore it needs to be ‘worded’ in their language and be meaningful to their individual contexts. In turn, those who implement the concept must be aware of the adequate and fitting language of their target group(s) or made aware of it as part of their professional development, for the implementation process. However, this ‘rewriting’ and ‘simplification’ of language to facilitate understanding nationally inevitably involves the loss of nuances along the way in the process.

Examples

- The Lithuanian Ministry of Education and Science with the support of policy advisers played a key role in developing a CMS-related policy. As a result of the co-operation of experts, researchers, practitioners, service providers the
set of CMS-related legal acts and methodologies have been developed, including the Career Education Programme for Secondary and VET schools. The programme includes a Matrix of Career Competences.

- In Malta, the importance of teaching CMS to students in compulsory education had been recognised for a number of years. This led to a Ministerial decision to include career education in the curriculum. The Ministry for Education and Employment set up a task force entrusted with the task of writing up ‘A Rationale and Framework for Career Education in Maltese Schools and Colleges’. This task force was made up of two Educational Officers of Personal, Social and Career Development (PSCD) and a College Career Adviser under the supervision of a Service Manager, Student Services Department, Directorate for Educational Services and a Ministry Adviser. This taskforce was a key driver in the policy development and implementation process.

- The National Unit for Lifelong Guidance in of VOX (a government body) co-operated with the Norwegian Directorate for Education and Training and The Norwegian Directorate of Work and Welfare in implementing the CMS-perspective in the Norwegian context. The process has mostly been a bottom-up approach, with involvement of practitioners and experts/researchers. The government/other governmental bodies at higher level have not yet been much involved. The focus during 2012-2014 has been on agenda setting and the strategy has been to inform and initiate discussions on the relevance of the CMS perspective in the Norwegian context.

Conclusions and Recommendations

- It is recommended to compose/convene a diverse group of stakeholders which includes experts to explore the concept of Lifelong guidance and of CMS, to reach consensus on the rationale for introducing these concepts, its nature, value and suitability for further national or regional development, to resolve the language issues related to the definition of CMS, to discuss the “Questions that policies need to address” in the CMS chapter of the Resource Kit (ELGPN, 2012a, p. 22–23), to propose an agenda, to draft an initial plan to facilitate a common understanding of CMS and to ensure that the plan is revised regularly.

- It is recommended to quote the original definition of lifelong guidance and CMS in the English language in materials alongside the national translation or adaptation thereof so that readers can refer to the original immediately and see the difference.

- A recommended second step to (further) develop policies for guidance provision with a focus on CMS development, is to draft a national CMS framework which articulates the rationale behind the CMS development and the content of CMS programmes for different age and target groups (ELGPN, 2012a).

- It is recommended that the CMS Framework (ELGPN, 2012a, p.94), the ELGPN QAE framework (ELGPN, 2012a, p.96 – 105) and the Guidelines for Policies and Systems Development for Lifelong Guidance: A Reference Framework for the EU and for the Commission (ELGPN, 2015b) should be used in developing CMS-related national policies. A useful tool may be the ELGPNs’ Glossary (ELGPN, 2012c) which provides a common set of definitions for guidance policy development and related guidance terminology.

- It is recommended that the valuable suggestions relating to the policy development and implementation of CMS in the different sectors (Gravina and Lovšin, 2012) should be used, which draws attention to four key aspects that impact on the policy implementation process: 1) the policy to be implemented; 2) the people involved in the implementation; 3) the place
or context of implementation; 4) the pace of implementation.

- It is worthwhile examining existing CMS frameworks. It helps to identify the common emerging themes found in the different frameworks. Generally, what is different is not the “What is to be learned?”, “When?” or “Where?”, but the “How?” – due to different curricular traditions. There are a few existing national CMS frameworks:
  - Canadian\(^2\), Australian\(^3\) and USA\(^4\): Blueprints for Career Development. These frameworks were developed over a decade ago. A critical exploration of these Blueprint versions, including some experiences in the ELGPN, exists (see: Hooley, \textit{et al.}, 2013). In a professional guidance environment these blueprints are being acknowledged as useful and usable. However they seem too complicated in a semi-professional environment as Norway reported.
  - Other existing national CMS frameworks include:
    - Scotland: CMS framework\(^5\).
    - New Zealand: Career Education benchmarks for primary, secondary and tertiary education\(^6\). These benchmarks differ from other frameworks because in addition to describing learner outcomes, they include input and process benchmarks (leadership, organisational, employer involvement).
    - The Portuguese CMS framework which is included as an example in the Resource Kit (ELGPN, 2012a, p.94).
    - Ireland proposed a national framework in the report of the National Guidance Forum in 2007, \textit{Guidance for Life}\(^7\), but this has not been nationally adopted. The national CMS framework can also be inspired by:
      - Twenty-First Century Skills\(^8\).
      - Key Competences for Lifelong Learning (EU Parliament and Council, 2006)
      - DOTS framework (Law and Watts, 1977) and an update: the Se-Si-F-U model (Law, 2007).

- It is recommended that a national CMS framework of competences should be developed by experts, professionals, social partners and other stakeholders, ideally accompanied by a description of input and process standards (leadership, organisational, employer involvement etc.). Simply mapping CMS without adherence to a pre-selected (and pre-agreed) model will not bring a meaningful result.

- The policy approach and their focus on CMS related policies across the ELGPN member countries varied considerably, as illustrated by the three examples from Lithuania, Malta and Norway in the paragraph ‘Examples’ above. Nowadays, policy is acknowledged as ‘a game board with multiple players’. These players can be found in and outside of government. The implication of the multiple agents in policy work is that attention shifts from a hierarchical and instrumental, outcome-oriented focus (advising the decision-makers on appropriate goals) to an interactive, process-oriented one (incorporating stakeholders and generating agreed outcomes). It is recommended that policy-makers decide at various stages, if and which stakeholders/agents they want to include in policy development and if the focus of the task is outcome- or process-oriented.

\(^2\) Canada: http://www.blueprint4life.ca/blueprint/home.cfm/lang/1  
\(^3\) Australia: http://www.blueprint.edu.au/  
\(^5\) Scotland: http://www.skillsdevelopmentscotland.co.uk/media/752669/career_management_skills_framework_scotland.pdf  
\(^6\) New Zealand: http://www.careers.govt.nz/educators-practitioners/planning/career-education-benchmarks  
How can such competences be taught in educational and other contexts, in ways that, while effectively catering for all citizens, are also sensitive to different life development challenges, and the specific concerns of groups and individuals with diverse social, economic, cultural and other needs? Which pedagogical/andragogical strategies and resources are most effective in enabling the mastery of career management competences?

Lessons learned (What works? What does not work?)

- As set out in the previous questions a CMS framework, detailing the CMS development of all citizens over the life-span, addresses the questions:
  - What CMS (knowledge, skills and attitude) to learn?
  - How to learn CMS?
  - When or where/in which context are CMS learned?
  - How is the CMS framework going to be evaluated?

Such a CMS framework can also be drafted for one or more sectors. The CMS framework, detailing the CMS development of all students, should be mandatory (in the curriculum) for schools, training and education institutions.

- For adults, whether employed or unemployed, CMS development should be based on the reflection and the evaluation of the career competences they have already acquired. A CMS framework provides a basis for this assessment and the guiding principles for further development. The guidance of adults should be based on their identified needs and built on to existing CMS strengths and capacities.

- The pedagogical/andragogical strategy in CMS development should be inspired, continuously informed and powered by the (latest) career development theories and methodologies, and by educational pedagogical innovations. The approach should be tailored to the specific concerns of groups and individuals with their diverse social, economic, cultural and other needs.

- In an educational setting experiential learning is preferred for CMS development. Learning about and accepting other people’s feedback on his/her behaviour is an important part of CMS development and which could contribute to social inclusion policies. The experiential
Learning should be combined with activities outside educational institutions (e.g. workplaces visits, internships, job shadowing, career events, meeting with employers) to learn about the world of work.

- In addition to individual support, groups sessions are effective, given that they tailor the provision to and focus on the specific issues of the target group, their context and their attention span.

- There is among countries a growing acceptance of linking HE to the world of work and society at large as described in the Resource Kit (ELGPN, 2012a, p.22 and p.28). The term ‘students’ employability’, which is strongly related to CMS, has become widely accepted and the search for the enhancement of employability has become a core characteristic of HE institutions and the European Higher Education Area. To achieve high-quality standards in academic learning and at the same time to enhance employability by fostering CMS is not a contradiction. Both of them may lead students’ active engagement in their HE academic study and in the career process (Rott, 2015a).

- ICT may be an (additional) means to reach specific target groups. Some countries use ICT instruments to support the CMS development of citizens.

- The skills, training and attitudes of the (semi-) professional practitioners that provide CMS development are critical in the success of citizens’ development of CMS over their lifetime.

- In Cyprus, the Career Counselling and Education Service (CCES) of the Ministry of Education and Culture is responsible for career education during Secondary Education (from the age of 12 – 18) in general. The career lessons are offered during the first semester of Year III (9th Grade) of the Gymnasium for all students in public schools. They also offer Career Counselling and Guidance to students in Tertiary Education as well as Adult Learners. The aims of this education are to promote self-awareness, career management and decision-making skills. In addition, students are supported with counselling for personal issues as well as guidance in educational and occupational matters.

- In Croatia good practice examples concerning guidance and CMS development are to be found in schools, VET and the employment service centres for lifelong career guidance.

- In the Czech Republic, the national curriculum is based on key competences. In addition to subject-specific knowledge and skills it is necessary to equip students with the knowledge, skills, attitudes and values from which they can benefit not only in initial and further education, but also in their personal lives and professional careers. All students are able to use and apply them regardless of the school, interests and what they might want to do in the future. This current life skills approach in education can be compared to that of the CMS. However, some distinctions are apparent, which can be built upon especially in the context of the educational area ‘World of work’. This is a compulsory topic for Year 8 and 9 students (often a stand-alone subject) and a cross-curricular subject taught throughout the upper secondary school level.

- In Finland, in the national core curricula for comprehensive and upper general level education, career education is described as a mainstream strategy and a responsibility of all staff. The basic goals of the core curricula for guid-

Examples

- The Nordic countries prepared a Concept Note on CMS in the Nordic context in 2013–14, adopted the term ‘career competences’ for CMS, and are proposing the concept of ‘career learning’ for further development in each of the countries involved (Thomsen, 2014).
Acquisition and Development of Career Management Skills

Acquisition and counselling are to: 1) support personal growth and development of the students; 2) promote the development of study skills and to help in learning difficulties and 3) counsel and guide the students in educational and occupational orientation.

• In Greece, the National Organisation for the Certification of Qualifications and Vocational Guidance (EOPPEP) has developed ICT self-evaluating tools for adolescents and adults, so they can be able to build and access their skills. An E-portfolio development tool is offered to adolescents via an online guidance portal9. The digital tool allows completing the e-portfolio also in the English language. The portal shows a real example of an e-portfolio completed by a high school student.10 Also, the Real Game for adolescents aged 12–15 and 15–18, translated and adapted to the Greek context will be soon included in the portal so as to help adolescents to develop and access life and career skills. An E-Portfolio Development Tool is offered to adults by the Lifelong Career Development Portal for adults 11 which allows completing the e-portfolio also in the English language. In addition, a CMS Section, including interactive CMS activities and CMS learning material, is offered to adults in order to help them to understand and access several aspects of their career development.

• In Icelandic lower and upper secondary schools CMS is a part of Life Skills within social studies.

• Malta has developed a career education learning outcomes curriculum for the teaching of career education within the subject Personal, Social and Career Development for compulsory education. This framework is currently being revised as part of a national curriculum review system. In addition to class-based teaching, a number of career guidance initiatives are also held in and outside schools to complement this learning. These latter initiatives are held by a number of qualified career advisors who have been employed by the Directorate for Educational Services since October 2009.

• Romania has a national “Personal development” curriculum for grades 0 (6 years old), 1st and 2nd grade. The Ministry of Education plans to develop these for all grades, embedding CMS through guidance activities. The curriculum of counselling and guidance for VET, grades 9, 10 and 11 was elaborated in August 2014, integrating CMS and highlighting the role of counseling and guidance in preparing VET students for the labour market and providing them with the necessary skills.

• Scotland uses CMS as the framework for web-based guidance instruments.

• The strategy of the Swiss Conference of Cantonal Ministers of Education (EDK) for the period 2015-2019 points out the importance of CMS, in particular to inform all young people and adult citizens of the large possibilities created by the flexible educational system in Switzerland. This should support the integration of almost the whole population into a secondary level education, to empower resourceful persons, and to counteract the shortage of professionals.

Conclusions and Recommendations

• CMS should be considered as a ‘work in progress’ for each individual citizen. Citizens will have developed CMS to varying degrees and the acquisition of CMS should not be assumed among children, young people and adults.

• It is recommended for reasons of consistency to use the same (theoretical) concepts under-
pinning the CMS-related policies across the various sectors.

• In practice the methodology of CMS programmes should vary depending on the needs of users. However, be aware that populations may have very different needs. Early school leavers and NEET (Not in Education, Employment or Training) may need a different approach. Several examples for these groups across Europe can be found in the ELGPN Concept Note No.6. Early School Leaving and Lifelong Guidance (Oomen and Plant, 2014) and in PES practices for the outreach and activation of NEETs (European Commission, 2015b).

• Youth unemployment has significant implications for individuals, communities, economies and societies. It is recommended to take notice of the interesting guidance practices including CMS development emerging in different EU Member States in response to youth unemployment (Hughes and Bors Borbély-Pecze, 2012) and the opportunities within the Youth Guarantee Initiatives (Borbély-Pecze and Hutchinson, 2014a).

• Work-based learning performs different functions in relation to European countries’ skills systems. It offers young people a way of learning about jobs and work to help inform their choices; but it also provides skills, knowledge and accreditation which give people access to opportunities (Borbély-Pecze and Hutchinson, 2014b). CMS development should be built into work-based learning.

• CMS development, on or offline, will need to be more readily available for all citizens (Hooley, 2014).

• As CMS teaching and training are critical in the success of the CMS development of all citizens, support is recommended for guidance counsellors and semi-professionals through professional development, resources and mentoring.
How can different providers work together to offer CMS programmes more effectively, in ways that make the best use of their specialised knowledge of the worlds of education, training, and employment?

Lessons learned
(What works? What does not work?)

- In drafting a national CMS framework, a coordinated approach should involve stakeholders across various policy sectors: schools, VET, HE, adult education, employment and social inclusion. The same applies to CMS programmes arising from or initiated at regional and local levels. The working methodology in this co-operation involves the discussion of the aim and objectives of the intervention to be undertaken as well as the general concept and content, and in such a way that each of the service providers has a shared understanding and takes their particular responsibility.
- Parents of students are underutilised community resources with specialised knowledge of the world of work in various industries.

Examples

- In Cyprus, the different providers work together through the National Forum of Guidance where the Ministry of Education and Culture, the Ministry of Labour Welfare and Social Insurance and the Human Resource Development Authority co-operate in order to promote and share the knowledge of the world of education, training and employment. Through their co-operation with Euroguidance Greece and Cyprus, school counsellors attended seminars on CMS.
- In the Czech Republic, the National Guidance Forum’s current action plan (2014–2016) promotes the preparation of specific steps and commitments of career guidance actors, which enables the implementation of an integrated system of career guidance in the lifelong perspective.
- As part of school reform in Denmark, a revision of the mandatory subject ‘Education and Job’ in compulsory education has been made which means that there will be a stronger co-operation between schools and local guidance centres. The changes give a clearer focus on CMS development/career learning at different
levels in school. The intention is to improve students’ self-awareness in relation to educational and labour market possibilities.

- In Finland, schools are required to provide a school-level plan of career education and guidance with the allocation of tasks to different staff members. The local curriculum must include a description of how co-operation with the local labour market and business community is being implemented within the school. Classroom visits by labour market representatives, visits to workplaces, project work, the use of different sectors’ information materials and introduction-to-working-life periods are central parts of this co-operation. The content of different subjects is structured to include modules that connect the knowledge and skills provided by the subject to the demands and possibilities of working life. Students and their parents should have the chance to receive information on the working approaches and possibilities of various choices within basic education, and on its implications for the student’s studies and future. The parent/guardian must be given opportunities to discuss issues related to the student’s studies and choices by meeting collectively with the teacher, study counsellor and student.

- In Germany a general agreement between the Standing Conference of Education Ministers of the 16 Länder and the Federal Employment Agency, with complementary agreements on regional levels, defines the institutionalised co-operation between schools and guidance counsellors in the local employment offices in CMS education (KMK/BA, 2004). There is a CMS framework which defines the goals and learning outcomes of this joint responsibility. In addition the Network Schools and Enterprises, Arbeitseigentlichschaften Schule-Wirtschaft, as well as trade unions are engaged in providing joint projects for career education, work experience and other CMS activities for students12.

- At national level in Greece, the National Organisation for the Certification of Qualifications and Vocational Guidance (EOPPEP) has introduced CMS in guidance practice. It provides support for CMS development by implementing CMS training targeted at the end user in order to help them to acquire CMS. In secondary education, the “Career Education Programmes” supported by the 79 Centres for Career Guidance (KESYPs) aim to develop the CMS of its target group (students and young adults up to 25 years old). The Career Offices of the Universities also support the CMS of students by providing seminars on job-search techniques, decision-making skills, etc.

- In Malta, the Directorate for Educational Services and the Malta Career Guidance Association liaise with major entities such as the Employment and Training Corporation (ETC), the European Union Programmes Agency (EUPA) and other national authorities such as the Malta Financial Services Authority (MFSA), the Malta Tourism Authority (MTA), the Malta Information Technology Agency (MITA), the Management of the National Health Sector and a number of private institutions to provide career guidance opportunities to students so that they acquire CMS at an early stage during compulsory schooling and also to provide career-guidance training opportunities to practitioners working both in the field of education and also that of employment.

- The Norwegian project ‘Public Employment Service (PES) Guiders in Upper Secondary School’ is an example illustrating topics and

12 Among the various provisions, see in particular: http://jugend.dgb.de/schule/beratung/berufswahlhilfe ja http://www.schulewirtschaft.de/www/schulewirtschaft.nsf/id/PageOrganisation_DE?open
Effective Stakeholder Co-operation

methods relevant to promoting/conducting CMS Programmes. This project is organised by the Directorate of Labour and Welfare in some counties (currently involving 12 PES offices and schools and continuously evolving). It has been integrated as part of the ‘New Possibilities Project’ until 2016. PES guidance officers are located at upper secondary school (e.g. 4 days a week) to ensure that students with challenges can be given proper help at the earliest possible occasion (early intervention); to provide better knowledge of the local/regional labour market; strengthen the students’ motivation to complete education; and to provide early relevant multidisciplinary services from PES and other relevant providers according to needs of students.

- In Serbia, the 500+ Initiative was very successful in engaging parents – modelling ‘networking’ as a CMS to find enterprises that were willing to organise job-shadowing for students.
- In Switzerland, every canton has a specialised team with delegates of the guidance, employment and the social insurance services: inter-institutional teamwork (IIZ). This team has the task of co-operating to find the best solution for those people who lack CMS and to help them to find a job or a training possibility.

Conclusions and Recommendations

- A National Guidance Forum or similar national co-ordination mechanism provides an ideal opportunity for co-operation on CMS-related policies and for co-ordinating the shared guidance provision for citizens. In various Member-States such a Forum has been established to achieve an integrated system for lifelong guidance. The National Guidance Forum should represent all key stakeholders, have a clear remit to develop a CMS framework, advise on CMS-related policies and be in direct contact with Ministries. In such a Forum the different providers can work together to offer CMS programmes more effectively.
- Encourage not only collaboration but also the development of mutual trust among providers of services in CMS development across sectors at national, regional and site-level.
- It is recommended to consider providing a diverse range of services – i.e. guidance and CMS development – throughout the lifespan within one organisational framework as it is considered potentially more cost-effective, avoiding unnecessary duplication of resources (OECD, 2004).
Who should provide CMS training, and what role should be played by guidance staff in developing and delivering CMS training in different contexts and settings? How can CMS staff be trained in ways that render them more effective in helping citizens to develop CMS?

**Lessons learned**

*(What works? What does not work?)*

- CMS teaching and training should be delivered by skilled, well-trained and motivated staff whether they are professional or semi-professional. Semi-professionals, as e.g. teachers or employment counsellors, are people who provide guidance as part of their job, but are not necessarily trained in guidance. Those persons who support learning in informal and non-formal settings should be capable of initial or intermediate interventions in CMS provision.

- Guidance professionals, as e.g. guidance or career counsellor, specialised psychologist in education or specialised social worker in PES, should not only play a role in providing guidance and in helping citizens to acquire CMS. They should co-operate with and support (with e.g. advice, training, 'supervision') semi-professionals and intermediates towards CMS provision in understanding, developing and delivering their task in CMS development with students and clients.

- Semi-professionals are not necessarily highly interested in the guidance and CMS development part of their job. If spread over a variety of institutions (possibly with different functions), this delivery model bears a high risk of either fragmentation or overlap of career guidance services (Zelloth, 2009).

- In Educational institutions where teachers are involved in the CMS development of students, the guidance professional(s) and the head teacher/management should collaborate with teachers, parents, external service providers, to help them understand the CMS provision and their expected participation in it.

- The need for teachers to be well-prepared for their assigned guidance task and the development of CMS can be underestimated nationally. 42% of European teachers currently have a high or moderate level of need for professional development in career guidance as shown in the Teaching and Learning International Survey.

- Attention is drawn to the requirement of “practical knowledge of individual action planning including the promotion of career management skills / employability” as part of the recent published European reference competence profile for PES and EURES counsellors (European Commission, 2014, p. 2, 8 and 17).

- Both in initial and continuous professional training, the personal career of the professional and the semi-professional in guidance provision is an important means (e.g. assessing own CMS development, drafting a career plan) of achieving a greater understanding of CMS development among students and clients.

Examples

- In a current implementation approach in Austria, a school inspector representing the school board works together with a representative of a teacher training college. They elaborate a comprehensive approach that is then distributed and discussed within the school board with head teachers. Teachers are invited to training sessions in which they work on CMS and on methods to support students developing CMS. The next step is for the teachers who visited the training sessions to elaborate on this through a written concept on school development with their colleagues at school. This group presents the concept to the school inspector, representing the school board, followed by a presentation of the school development plans to head teachers as an important issue in the school development process.

- In Cyprus, the content of the mandatory career education during the first semester of Year III of the Gymnasium (14–15 year olds) is defined by the Ministry of Education and Culture. Schools are required to make an institutional plan assisted by an experienced careers teacher.

- In the Czech Republic, a new qualification standard for guidance practitioners in education has been introduced in order to promote the validation of non-formal and informal learning and raising the standard in the field of career guidance. A corresponding training programme was piloted, with the inclusion of the CMS concept.

- In Germany, some of the 16 Regional Governments have established extensive professional training for teachers with career guidance duties, e.g. Bavaria with a 2 years university course (Graf, 2010).

- In Hungary, CMS development is included in the curricula of the initial and continuing education of teachers at primary, lower and upper secondary levels so that CMS becomes an integral and mandatory feature of educational programmes (formal learning) throughout teacher training.

- In Switzerland, each guidance service centre supports and co-operates with teachers of compulsory and secondary school to implement CMS training in school. Teachers also have the possibility of getting a specialised training in CMS development at a university of applied sciences.

Conclusions and Recommendations

- For semi-professionals such as class or subject teachers and employment counsellors, guidance and developing CMS skills in their students/clients can be considered as an added value to their professional work and promoted as such.

- It is highly recommended that all semi-professionals should have the opportunity to qualify in guidance and have the support/ co-operation of guidance professionals to develop and maintain the lifelong guidance perspective.
• If an individual career plan is one of the outcomes of CMS teaching and training, it is recommended that the practitioners in guidance should develop their own career plans and assess their CMS during their own training, to avoid the risk they do something they do not understand or do not believe in themselves.

• Consider the revision of the existing training programmes for both professionals and semi-professionals in guidance. All initial training of guidance practitioners should include the compulsory subject ‘guidance’ or ‘career learning’. Its content should include the theoretical background and methodologies of CMS development, formative assessment of CMS development, and how to integrate CMS teaching in (school) subjects. For semi-professionals as teachers it is important to give them the opportunity of real experiences in enterprises.

• “Strengthen co-operation between those involved in guidance and the social partners, teacher representative organisations, subject associations, school head organisations, representatives of VET providers and inspectorates, in order to ensure more joined-up thinking in the implementation of policies in guidance and initial and continuing teacher education and/or training” (ELGPN Concept Note No. 7, 2015a).

• It is recommended to invest and encourage the common understanding of CMS delivery across sectors. This could be implemented by a common training module for practitioners from different sectors (teachers, guidance counsellors, PES officers, HR-consultants, and career consultants) targeted at the various sectors and different target groups. This common training module could be considered as a compulsory part of continuous professional development.

• Adopt one way known in Europe for improving the competences of guidance practitioners: legislation (e.g. Finland, Poland, Slovakia and Austria); licensing arrangements (e.g. Bulgaria and Poland); quality standards (e.g. Latvia); accreditation from an (inter)national professional body; register of practitioners (e.g. Portugal, Czech Republic, Germany and UK) (ELGPN, 2015c) and insist on ‘CMS development of citizens’ as one of the key competences.
What strategic policy decisions need to be taken in order to widen access to CMS provision, to ensure its quality, and to ensure that all citizens have the opportunity to master key career management competences effectively?

Lessons learned
(What works? What does not work?)

- In order to inform strategic decision-making on the provision of CMS, it is necessary to make politicians and policy-makers aware of what CMS are, why provisions on CMS development are needed, how such provision will be used, the benefits and importance of mastering CMS both for society and individual citizens, the current needs and gaps, and the urgency of the policy.
- As politicians and policy-makers may be sensitive to public opinion or to stakeholders’ interests, such awareness raising may be broadened and tailored to these specific groups too.
- A necessary strategy in preparing policy decisions on CMS appears to be to improve the visibility of the available guidance and CMS provision in a country for both citizens and policy-makers. The existing CMS provision may be embedded in different sectors, fields, curricula and subjects, which make it hard to evaluate and assess its quality.
- A revision of the existing documents, regulations and laws on lifelong guidance provision appears to be needed to find out if all citizens and specific target groups have access to CMS provision.
- To boost the widening of access to CMS development in a country, guidance (e.g. career education and guidance) should be made a compulsory element of curricula in schools, VET and HE.
- To assure quality assurance of CMS provision it is important to link CMS to the country’s quality assurance framework(s) for education, training and employment.
- Initial training and the continuing professional development of (semi-) professionals in guidance and CMS development, which operate at least at graduate/post-graduate level, should be assessed and accredited against standards for quality assurance on a national level and/or in higher education in Europe.
- Attention is drawn to the findings of the Special
Strategic Policy Decisions

Eurobarometer (July 2014) on the provision of career guidance services to EU citizens. Forty-five percent of respondents indicated they did not have access to guidance services. Concerning its value to them, 71% agreed that it helped their education and training choices; 62% for finding a job; and 53% for finding work and learning opportunities abroad.

Examples

- In Cyprus, CMS development should further be enhanced as part of the curriculum. One of the objectives of the National Forum of Guidance is that CMS development should become part of the school curriculum in general.
- In Greece, several CMS tools have been introduced in the EOPPEP online guidance portals for adolescents and youngsters (see Chapter 2).
- In Latvia, the Ministry of Education and Science has delegated the State Education Content Centre (VISC) and State Education Assessment Service (IKVD) as the implementing agencies for careers education and guidance in schools and VET which includes CMS. VISC integrated CMS development within the subject guidelines of the national education standards in secondary schools. IKVD has initiated a process for assessing how CMS are being taught in schools.
- Given the existence of mandatory guidance in compulsory education and the PES supporting participants in non- and informal education, in Slovakia, the greatest challenge is to set up and integrate the overall system synergy, including quality assurance and coherent funding.
- In Sweden, to secure CMS development, CMS is partly integrated in the curriculum, in the steering documents for compulsory school, upper secondary school and adult education. CMS is also integrated in the in-service training/courses for teachers and counsellors, offered by the National Board of Education. In higher education it is more complicated as universities are autonomous. While CMS is not on their agenda – being part of the European Higher Education Area – the issue of students’ employability is given attention. Policy documents may inspire these educational institutions to introduce CMS development.
- In the frame of the implementation of an inter-cantonal agreement in 2007 of a standardisation of school targets in Switzerland, guidance and CMS development are compulsory element of curricula in the schools of almost every canton.

Conclusions and Recommendations

- The endorsement of policy decisions on CMS development for citizens should be undertaken at a high level at the relevant ministries and ratified with laws, acts, or measures, adequate funding and resources, co-ordinated national strategies, common milestones, and common further implementation steps.
- In widening access to CMS development, compulsory guidance in schools can play an important role (Sweet, Nissinen and Vuorinen, 2014) and is recommended as the place where it should start in a country.
- As part of the Skills Outlook 2015 Youth, Skills and Employability the OECD discusses how to ensure that all young people leave school with relevant skills for life (including work) and recommended the role of guidance: “Base career guidance services on relevant assessment of the market returns of various career paths.” (OECD, 2015, p.17).
- To promote an integrated approach to CMS/career management competence and student-centred learning and to embed it in the European university system, exchange-based interrelated action is needed on various levels:
European and national policy development; HE institutional governance; faculties and academic staff; student guidance and counselling services; students as individual learners and stakeholders; as well as on the level of cooperation with regional and national employers and enterprises. Rott (2015a, 2015b) provides case studies of successful implementation of CMS in HE.

- An important policy issue in improving access and addressing social equity is to employ a systems approach in developing pro-active guidance services and in all sectors with the key aim to acquire CMS. It is recommended that this approach include strategies such as ‘reaching out, rather than waiting for people to come’, building a culture of learning by raising awareness and by encouraging individuals to invest in their own skills development and to manage their motivation and self-confidence (ELGPN, 2012a, p. 36).

- Traditional guidance service – of which CMS development is a key aim – are impacted by cross-sector partnerships involving public, private and third sectors. As a consequence, in the area of funding, many governments are increasingly using private and non-profit entities to provide goods and services to citizens (OECD, 2010).

- The skills, training and dispositions of practitioners who deliver training and teach CMS development are critical to its success. Consider eventually a (cross-)sector approach in relation to the qualification and training of guidance practitioners in the area of CMS development.

- It is recommended that strategic policy decisions on CMS development should be informed by research and evidence as provided by the ELGPN Evidence Guide (Hooley, 2014).
How can the mastery of career management competences be assessed and accredited in ways that support career development for different target groups and across different life stages?

Lessons learned
(What works? What does not work?)

- The functions of the assessment of CMS may include (a) informing students/clients about their progress and indicating next steps, (b) informing others (such as parents and employers) about the new or improved competences of an individual, (c) providing credentials that formally signal a competence profile, and (d) encouraging engagement and motivation.
- Assessment is most effective when it is timely, specific, personalised challenging, and constructive (Sultana, 2013).
- It is debatable if CMS development can be measured and assessed other than formatively (assessment for learning), as a didactic tool for self-development. However, this should not block efforts to develop summative assessment (assessment of learning) which may be needed for programme-evaluation reasons.
- Parallel to the development of a national CMS framework, the development of the tools for assessing CMS development should be undertaken.
- The assessment of mastering CMS among citizens is closely linked to the existence of a definition of CMS, a national CMS framework and the derived and defined learning outcomes. Furthermore, the assessment is closely linked to the applied pedagogical/andragogical strategies and resources, and to the general awareness and understanding of CMS by skilled, well-trained and motivated practitioners who are delivering the provision.
- In general, assessing soft skills, of which CMS are an example, proved to be hard across Member States both in the educational and in the PES context. ELGPN delegates describe it as ‘an underdeveloped assessment area’.
- The choice of strategies to assess CMS development in the educational sector presents specific challenges as both process and outcomes are important and because in formal education settings guidance is often diffused throughout the curriculum rather than as a stand-alone “subject” (Sultana, 2012b).
Assessment and Accreditation

- In various countries a portfolio (or ‘personal development plan’, ‘individual action plan’) that focus on reflection and learning, and which track personal development is a preferred assessment tool. The national, regional and local introduction of portfolios etc. should be accompanied by an appropriate policy on the assessment strategy for CMS development (Sultana, 2013).

- Attention is drawn to the literature that highlights the value of portfolios for citizens, and particular for vulnerable groups of students and youths, such as those from difficult economic backgrounds, low achievers, and individuals with disabilities (Sultana, 2013) and in recent reports for asylum seekers and economic immigrants (Cedefop, 2014).

- E-portfolios are most frequently used in the education sector.

Examples

- Student portfolios, which include CMS development, are used in Austria, Croatia, Denmark, Finland, France, Germany, Greece, Luxembourg, Italy and UK, and are being introduced in Malta and Cyprus.

- The use of portfolios in employment service settings are rare, other than, as an electronic platform for displaying job-seekers’ competence profiles as in Belgium, Germany, Italy and the Netherlands for example.

- Practitioners in individual schools develop portfolios (e.g. Malta). Portfolios are also being developed through collaboration between practitioners in a small group of institutions, e.g. the Portefeuille d’Expériences et de Compétences (PEC) in France, the Talent Portfolio in Austria, Beufswahlpass and Profilpass in Switzerland and Germany (Sultana, 2011).

- In Ireland, during implementation of a CMS Framework, students’ development of CMS was assessed by guidance counsellors using pre-defined success criteria.

- In pre-vocational education (lower secondary) in the Netherlands, CMS development of students is being assessed (formatively and summatively) as of 2016–17, by means of a student portfolio.

Conclusions and Recommendations

- It is recommended that the assessment of the mastery of CMS development should not be restricted to self-assessment only; it should be linked to and set against societal challenges, managing difficult situations, reacting positively to changes.

- Formative assessment is considered particularly suitable for evaluating career management skills. The use of career learning portfolios opens up opportunities for insightful reflection on one’s career development, and for career conversations with guidance practitioners.

- Awards and other mechanisms to recognise and accredit experiences related to the development of CMS are features of effective guidance.
How can we ensure that citizens are able to decode the world around them, so that while they are empowered to develop key competences that support career development, they are also critically aware of the economic constraints that limit their options and capacities, and do not assume that they are individually responsible for structural and systemic failures?

**Lessons learned**
(What works? What does not work?)

- Key to effective CMS development of citizens – which empower them to develop CMS and understand external influences – is a skilled, well-trained and motivated staff who have a holistic approach to guidance (life-long, life-wide), understand what CMS are, and can teach them accordingly.
- Both psychological and sociological perspectives on career development and basic understanding of how the labour market works are important parts of the initial training and continuous professional development of guidance (semi-)professionals. Basic knowledge of, access to up-to-date labour market information and to current career information, and the knowledge and competence to help clients/students to make meaning of it, are part of the task of guidance (semi-)professionals.
- Guidance professionals could benefit from mobility: having the opportunity to regularly explore and get updated on national, regional and local labour markets. And they could benefit from working abroad to become more familiar with different economic systems, with opportunities for and methods to empower their clients with CMS development.
- There is a need for accessible labour market information for students to enable them to decode the surrounding world. This is not yet the case as quality career guidance based on labour market information is not available to all VET students in Europe (European Parliament, 2014) and neither can CMS development can be based on that.
- It is difficult to find examples to address this question as these objectives – CMS development and decoding the world – may be interwoven in many activities both in schools and PES. These objectives should be stated in terms of aiding an individual to obtain a realistic
view of self and the world of work and of their relationship to each other.

Examples

- In Malta, the information about job opportunities is provided on a national level by the Employment and Training Corporation (ETC) and also through various online opportunities, such as the Department of Information (DOI) website and the ‘government gazette’. Jobseekers can seek and access vacancy opportunities online.
- In Norway labour market courses provided by PES often include information about the current situation in the labour market aiming at giving the participants a realistic view of opportunities and requirements to get a job and stay in it, and how structural (and economic) mechanisms affect the individual’s options.
- In Switzerland guidance professionals are obliged by law to inform their clients about career opportunities in the labour market and to point them to current information about the career opportunities in the labour market on an internet platform13.

Conclusions and Recommendations

- Skilled, well-trained and motivated staff who teach and train CMS development to citizens should be aware that they have to raise awareness, to sensitise their student/client attitudes, to turn them positively towards career development in the context of unknown and unplanned learning and work changes which may be caused by factors outside their control, and to develop critical thinking.
- Attention is drawn to the OECD’s survey of adult skills (PIAAC) (OECD, 2013), which shows that workers who frequently use key skills at work not only have better career outcomes, but also integrate better into enterprises and are more productive. This supports Cedefop’s recommendation that by developing CMS, guidance helps to improve economic outcomes for enterprises and career outcomes for individuals (Cedefop, 2015).
- The curricula for schools, VET and HE should include basic education in or derived from subjects like economy, business administration, sociology, history and political sciences to help students understand the world of work, how economic and policy developments and decisions occur, and help them develop a critical view on their economic and social environment.

---

13 See: www.berufsbereitung.ch
How can CMS be developed with employed and unemployed people in PES contexts, in ways that support different transitions, and the specific needs and concerns of groups and individuals with diverse age, social, economic, cultural and other backgrounds?

Lessons learned (What works? What does not work?)

- For adults, whether employed or unemployed, CMS development should be based on the evaluation of the career competences they already have acquired. A CMS framework provides a basis for this assessment and the guiding principles for further development. The guidance of adults should be based on their identified needs and built on to existing CMS strengths and capacities.
- Tools need to be in place that support the identification of the needs of clients and their readiness for services.
- Individual action plans (IAPs) are commonly regarded as a way of empowering individuals: to maximise their potential, to support their CMS development, as well as to balance aspirations and capabilities against available options. Employment counsellors can use IAPs to empower clients to manage their learning and work pathways. Tensions exist between client centred and directive approaches to IAPs. Many employment counsellors feel more comfortable with a client centred approach to their practice, but have to operate within a policy context that is uncompromising regarding the extent to which sustainable employment outcomes are the only acceptable outputs. Under these circumstances, practitioners are generally left to try to reconcile these tensions for them. Training of PES staff and strong partnerships with complementary partners are needed to progress (European Commission, 2012).

Examples

- In Europe some tools used in PES also have guidance purposes and may be used for CMS development: Skills Health Check (UK), Profil-PASS (DE), My competence folder (DK), Bilan de Compétences (FR) and Bilanèní Diagnostika (CZ) (European Commission, 2014a).
• The OSS (One-Stop Shop) model which is being implemented in Germany, Greece, Spain, Italy and Portugal handles cases of both asylum seekers and economic immigrants individually and provides guidance through socio-cultural mediators.

• CMS development in guidance for migrants in the PES context are offered in France Cellule stages [Internship Cell]; in Spain Orientación formativa y laboral (AMIC) [Vocational guidance for Immigrants]; in England Prospects services by the National Careers Services; in Latvia as part of the active employment measures and preventative measures for unemployment; in Portugal as Profissional (GIP) [Professional insertion offices]; in Greece Topikés Dráseis Koinonikis Entaksis gia Evalotes Omádes – (TOP-EKO) [Local integrated programmes for the social inclusion of vulnerable groups; in Germany Migrantinnen fit für den Arbeitsmarkt (PiA) [Programme of Hessen ‘fit for the labour market’] (Cedefop, 2014).

• Finland started new CMS services in the employment sector at the beginning of 2013. The Employment and Economic Development Offices buy in services from other guidance providers. These services are: career coaching (max. 40 days in groups); job seeking (max. 20 days in groups); individual coaching and support for job finding/engaging (max. 50 hours/person/year). In 2014, a growing number of clients have participated in these services. In spring 2015, methods for assessing the results have been developed.

• The German Federal Employment Agency provides as a regular activity career coaching, job seeking skills and other CMS related learning courses or seminars in group settings according to the needs of individual unemployed persons. These are usually contracted out to guidance and placement agencies.

• The Greek PES OAED in the context of active employment policies recently introduced new advisory interventions supporting the unemployed to enter or re-enter the labour market. These services include group counselling workshops focusing on Counselling and Career Guidance, Career Management, Job searching Techniques and Entrepreneurial Counselling. The digital CMS tools developed by EOPPEP (see chapter 2) are offered to the OAED end users via the OAED portal.

• In Malta, the subject previously known as Personal and Social Development (PSD) was changed to Personal and Social Career Development (PSCD) purposely to include labour-market and employability-related content.

• In Slovakia, citizens in non-formal and informal education have access to the services of PES and 25 regional adult guidance centres where their CMS can be developed.

• The Swedish PES carried out an ESF-funded pre-study in 2014 which focused on skills-based profiling and matching (Synliggöra kompetenser i matchningen, SKiM). The main purpose of the pre-study was to lay the foundations for an ESF-funded project to be launched in 2015. Guidance and jobseekers’ CMS development will be one of the main focus areas in the project.

• The Swiss canton of Luzern is piloting a project Perspective Bau which supports refugees in acquiring the skills to complete an apprenticeship as a construction professional. In another project in the canton of Luzern unemployed people get a fixed job with training and support of a job coach at the same time. Both projects include CMS development.

Conclusions and Recommendations

• CMS development is a rather new topic in the PES context due to renewed ‘Public Employment System’ (European Commission/DG for Employment, Social Affairs and Equal Opportunities (2013) in which “the provision of
(online) tools and primary services to support individual career management" (ibid. p.4) is foreseen. The development of CMS teaching methodologies for different groups of PES staff is currently been undertaken.

- A national CMS framework is considered as providing a base in the PES context for the assessment of attained CMS among individuals who are employed or unemployed. The recommended national CMS framework can illustrate the guiding principles for the further CMS development of each individual.
- It is recommended that guidance for economic migrants and political asylum seekers – as in the case of OSS, mainly consisting of information and advice – should be extended to CMS development. Induction programmes are considered to have a greater impact when complemented by further CMS development and initial career planning.
What role should be played by the social partners (employers and trade unions) in helping citizens to develop career management competences, facilitating their transitions throughout life?

### Lessons learned
(What works? What does not work?)

- The engagement of, interest in, and roles of employers and other social partners in CMS development differ across Member States as reported by ELGPN delegates.
- Trade unions inform their members about their rights, create awareness of related issues, for example, injustice in the workplace. In various countries trade unions may have a role in (re-)training and upskilling employees, provide guidance and train CMS development.
- Although employers express their interest in and the need for the development of soft skills among citizens, they and the research(er) in question are not aware that very often they actually mean CMS development.
- It should be made clear to social partners that CMS has a different individual developmental focus than HR in an enterprise. Critical to CMS development is that the acquired competences are transferable and usable outside a specific job or work.
- ELGPN delegates foresee an increasing role for employers in CMS development in the various sectors: schools, VET and also partly in HE, in adult learning and in employment.
- A more systematic approach is required in which stakeholders, social partners and policymakers can identify common targets via a dialogue. In a National Guidance Forum or similar entity/group, ideas and good practice can be shared and mediated by policy developers and ministries.

### Examples

- In Austria, teachers are offered the possibility of internships outside the school system and then have them reflect on and evaluate their experiences with experts, which include raising awareness of the CMS development of their students.
- In Cyprus, an attempt is being made for closer co-operation between education, employers
Role of Social Partners

and trade unions so that the CMS required by the employers will be included in the school curriculum and promoted by the Career Guidance Counsellors in schools.

- In Ireland, employers support school students’ career development through participation in mock interview sessions in schools, provision of work placement and work shadowing opportunities.
- Career exposure visits with a mentor from school and career weeks are considered as very useful in Maltese (state) schools. The engagement of employers at an early stage is considered to be essential in facilitating transitions from school to work.
- Employers in the Netherlands are mainly interested in co-operating with schools and PES in CMS development at regional level and hardly or not at all at a national level. The regional cooperation proved useful for the development of the practice of CMS development in Dutch schools.
- In Sweden, regional competence platforms identify key areas to be explored for their gaps and for their successes. A project with key skill areas in gaining skills and practice in the business environment and the development of CMS was very successful and will be extended to other partners.
- Switzerland’s dual-track VPET (Vocational and Professional Education and Training) system is collectively governed by the Confederation, the cantons and professional organisations. These three main partners co-operate to maintain a high level of quality within the VPET system. The social partners and the professional organizations are the main supporters of the VPET system in Switzerland and the Career Guidance Services, which promote CMS development, have a systematic collaboration with these organisations.

Conclusions and Recommendations

- Given that most citizens work in small and medium-sized enterprises that do not have HR departments, their CMS development is a strategic policy issue that government shares with social partners. Access to, quality of the provision and opportunity to master CMS will more likely be delivered through PES, through national or specialist career services, as a trade-union activity or through private providers (Cedefop, 2008).
- A smart (inter)national communication strategy is recommended that should make employers aware that by their desired ‘soft skills’ they actually mean CMS. And employers should be made aware of the links between their pursued ‘management by objectives’ and CMS development, and its benefits to both the employer and to the individual.
- Regional co-operation between employers, schools and PES in CMS development should be encouraged and enhanced as this platform is preferred over co-operation at national level by employers.
Which criteria should be used to evaluate the quality of CMS programmes?

Lessons learned
(What works? What does not work?)

- The common criteria that could be used to assess the quality of guidance are drawn from earlier OECD (2004) work and are identified by the ELGPN as a series of key elements that should be built into national systems to support quality service delivery and underpin the collection of evidence. Besides ‘service provision and improvement’ the key elements of the QAE are ‘practitioners’ competence’; ‘citizen/user involvement’, ‘cost-benefits to government’ and ‘cost-benefits to individuals’.
- Criteria and indicators for the evaluation of each of these elements are listed in Annex D of the Resource Kit. CMS is referred to in the latest version of the QAE Templates and based on member country inputs and feedback with various national examples (ELGPN, 2015c).
- For the quality evaluation of a CMS framework and/or for a CMS programme five types of assessment questions may be considered:
  - Needs assessment: Is there a need for this type of programme?
  - Theory assessment: Is this programme conceptualised in a way that it should work?
  - Implementation assessment: Was this programme implemented properly and according to the plan?
  - Impact assessment: Did this programme have an impact on its intended targets/target groups?
  - Efficiency assessment: Is this programme cost effective?
- At local and institutional levels, there needs to be in place a system to monitor the CMS development provision in order to collect data and be able to evaluate CMS activities by service providers for different target groups and across different life stages. The feedback derived from this monitoring and evaluation should lead to progressive quality of CMS delivery.
- Key challenges to the evaluation of CMS programmes include: CMS development takes place across a range of guidance activities and is difficult to measure in itself; and in practice
monitoring and evaluation of career guidance tends to be generic in nature and service oriented.

- Some ELGPN delegates observed that some important aspects of CMS development may get lost in an evaluation process that uses outcome indicators where less importance is attached to the process of learning itself.

- There are examples of national tracking studies for students of compulsory education and VET. They, however, do not evaluate the quality of CMS programmes offered nor their impact. If available, it provides educational institutions with valuable information on where and on which level of CMS further/higher education students are and how they progress. Patterns may be identified where students meet challenges in further/higher education or in the workplace. So school management can decide on changing and adjusting the school programme (subject content, didactical approach) and/or the guidance offered (e.g. identify specific target groups, initiate other activities, and enhance CMS development in certain areas).

**Examples**

- In Malta and the Netherlands, schools are being provided with public data on the destinations of school leavers and of their progress one year later. Such destination data may contribute to the evaluation of CMS programmes.

- In Croatia, quality standards for lifelong career guidance services in the employment sector are being used, including CMS development.

- In Denmark, career education, which includes CMS development, is an obligatory subject for students in compulsory education, the content of which is defined in the national core curricula. Schools are required to make an institutional plan for the implementation and evaluation of the services.

- Estonia has developed several tools to assure the quality of CMS training and guidance service provision.

- In comprehensive education in Finland, career education is a compulsory subject for students. The content is defined in the national core curricula. Schools are required to make an institutional plan for local implementation and evaluation of the services. The Finnish Institute for Educational Research (FIER) has been given a task to make a proposal for national feedback mechanisms for lifelong guidance services by 2016.

- In Germany the national programme *Berufseinstiegsbegleitung* for school leavers [Supporting transition from school to VET] was recently evaluated. The findings show that the programme has long term effects, two years after participation. Students who participated in additional CMS activities show a higher proportion of successful transitions and were much clearer in their vocational aspirations than those who did not participate in the programme.

- In Hungary, training on career education (including CMS related information and methods) has been offered to 3,000 teachers and 1,000 counsellors from different sectors (e.g. social inclusion, adult education, etc.). A survey in spring 2015 will give information about the career related services they provide and the efficiency of the CMS activities.

- In the Netherlands, the satisfaction of VET students with the CMS learning outcomes is being researched.

- During 2013, the Belgrade Open School in Serbia developed indicators and the methodology to measure effects of guidance upon the employability of young people. The research

---

results have shown that the users of the guidance services were more employable than those who have not used those services. During 2014 the research continued as a longitudinal study and applying an online database for the monitoring of effects.

- In Switzerland, the satisfaction of CMS learning is being researched among both students and teachers in compulsory school and in VPET.

Conclusions and Recommendations

- The use of the indicators and criteria in the ELGPN QAE framework (ELGPN, 2012a, Annex D pp.98-105) is recommended. The QAE Templates in ELGPN Tool No. 5 (ELGPN, 2015c) contain examples on what and how to evaluate the quality of CMS provision.

- Fostering a culture of evaluation within the career profession itself is recommended as an addition to an integrated approach to monitoring and evaluation of CMS programmes.

- Evaluating the quality of CMS programmes can follow the ‘context-input-process-outcomes’ evaluation framework and should cover the rationale, design, implementation and results of the ongoing or completed CMS programme.

- It is likely that the development of an evaluation strategy for CMS programmes will seek to make distinctions between what should be routinely monitored (e.g. client throughput; initial reaction) and what information might be collected in a more purposeful way from a sample of clients (levels of career management skills acquired; longer-term impacts). Therefore, key decisions need to be taken about which kinds of information fall into each of these categories. For example, should the first (and even the second) employment destination of client be routinely monitored? There is a cost to all data-collection processes: it is important that such costs are considered and weighed against possible efficacy benefits (Hooley, 2014, p.59).
Which kind of data needs to be generated in order to measure the impact of CMS programmes?

**Lessons learned**  
(What works? What does not work?)

- The measurement of the level of impact of CMS programmes, which can look at ‘input’ and ‘take-up’, is addressed in detail in the *Quality-Assurance and Evidence-Base (QAE) Framework* (ELGPN, 2012a, pp. 98–105) and provides examples of possible data to be generated to measure the impact of the key elements of guidance.

- *The Evidence-Base on Lifelong Guidance: A guide to key findings for effective policy and practice* (Hooley, 2014) discusses and brings together the evidence that exists for the impact of lifelong guidance and includes some examples for the impact of CMS programmes.

- Four levels of impact that can result from training and development, and which can be applied for CMS programmes, are being introduced in *The Evidence-Base on Lifelong Guidance: A guide to key findings for effective policy and practice* (Kirkpatrick in: Hooley, 2014, p. 16). The type of impact may relate to ‘educational outcomes’, ‘economic and employment outcomes’ and ‘social outcomes’ (ibid., pp. 16–17). Finally, it is possible to identify a range of different possible beneficiaries of the impact of guidance ranging from individuals to the European Union (ibid., pp. 17–18).

- Data protection poses a challenge to Member States to access, collect and match data.

**Examples**

- In Denmark, careers education has clear goals and a methodology for the activities being developed; and evidence, by evaluation, as part of this, is needed to show that careers education and CMS development do have an impact on pupils’ self-awareness, on the awareness of the opportunities given to them in education and at work; and that this is actively reflected upon by students.

- Within the National Youth Strategy 2015–2025, the Serbian Ministry of Youth and Sports emphasised the importance of developing mechanisms for measuring the effects of vari-
Monitoring Impact

ous guidance services on the employability and CMS development of young people, including the impact on different categories of youth.

- CMS as learning outcomes over the life-span are well-researched and documented in ELGPN Evidence Guide (Hooley, 2014). European research findings include:
  - CMS development as part of guidance in schools and VET is important in tackling early school leaving (ESL/ELET) and NEET (Not in Education, Employment or Training) (Oomen and Plant 2014, in: Hooley, 2014).
  - Dutch research shows that guidance in VET, based on dialogue, contributes to motivation, decision-making and career outcomes related to CMS development for students (Meijers, Kuijpers and Gund in: Hooley, 2014).
  - Research in England suggests that CMS development modules alongside year-long work placements in HE constitute an effective strategy to enhance the employability of graduates, both in employment level and rate (Taylor and Hooley, 2014).
  - Irish research found that a majority of adult learners reported that ‘one-to-one guidance helped with confidence building and decision-making skills’ and experiencing changes in in their situation (assessing education or career development) (Hearne, 2005 in: Hooley, 2014).
  - OECD’s 2013 survey of adult skills (PIAAC) shows that workers who frequently use key skills at work not only have better career outcomes, but also integrate better into enterprises and are more productive. By developing CMS, guidance helps improve economic outcomes for enterprises and career outcomes for individuals (Cedefop, 2015).
  - In Wales, job searching as part of guidance helped unemployed to improve their career direction (Powell, 2011 in: Hooley, 2014).
  - In Norway, adults in vulnerable job situations access guidance provision in career centres which they state as a crucial for a change in their current job or progression to another job (Guthu, Engh and Gravås, 2012 in: Hooley, 2014).
  - Research in Finland found that enhanced CMS led to decreased adult depressive symptoms and intentions to retire early (Vuori, Toppinen-Tanner and Mutanen, 2012 in: Hooley, 2014).

Conclusions and Recommendations

- Notice should be taken of the existing research methodology and findings and be taken into account in deciding on the nature of the impact to be measured.
- There are quantitative and various qualitative research approaches that have been used effectively in measuring the impact of guidance of which CMS are the learning outcomes. The ELGPN Evidence Guide (Hooley, 2014) provides several examples that illustrate ways of measuring the impact of CMS programmes.
Way Forward

The added value of the ELGPN needs continuation after 2015. Systematic exchange and mutual learning on steps for policy, strategy development and implementation of CMS remain important as this has had a considerable impact in the past, using the dynamics created through further European co-operation as gaps in lifelong guidance provision and CMS development still persist.


European Lifelong Guidance Policy Network (2015a). Addressing career guidance in teacher education and/or training. ELGPN Concept Note No.7. ELGPN University of Jyväskylä, Finland. [Online]. Available at: http://www.elgpn.eu/publications


References


Sultana, R.G. (2012a). Flexicurity. Implications for...
lifelong career guidance. ELGPN Concept Note No.1. ELGPN University of Jyväskylä, Finland. [Online]. Available at: http://www.elgpn.eu/publications/elgpn-concept-note-flexicurity


CAREER MANAGEMENT SKILLS (CMS) enable citizens to manage their individual life paths in education, training and work across the lifespan. This ELGPN Tool is addressed to policy-makers who wish to develop a comprehensive national guidance policy with the focus on the acquisition of CMS. This need may arise in the light of the various lifelong guidance policies which exist in Europe, of closing existing gaps in the national provision, and in meeting future approaches to lifelong guidance. This tool is intended to support policy-makers in considering key questions in CMS-related policies by sharing insights, good practices and conclusions across the ELGPN member-countries.

The ELGPN represents a major development in support of national lifelong guidance policy development in Europe. It currently has 30 member countries (AT, BE, BG, CY, CZ, DE, DK, EE, EL, ES, FI, FR, HR, HU, IE, IS, IT, LV, LT, LU, MT, NL, NO, PL, PT, RO, RS, SE, SI, and SK), with CH as an observer. The participating countries designate their representatives in the Network, and are encouraged to include both governmental and non-governmental representatives. As a Member-State-driven network, the ELGPN represents an innovative form of the Open Method of Co-ordination within the European Union (EU).